

The University of Manchester



Scientific reasoning at the age of Large Language Models (LLMs)

André Freitas & Neuro-Symbolic Al Group

University of Lincoln (March 2024)





Neuro-symbolic Al Group





More applied

Large Language Models (LLMs) for supporting scientific discovery.

More foundational

Paradigms for controlling inference over Language Models.



Hypotheses Questions

New context

New data



Hypotheses Questions

New context











New data



Hypotheses Questions

New context



<u>Select</u> relevant background knowledge









New data





New context

Elicit relevant patterns

Continuous

remission

Time

Contrast

to new data

Cell number



<u>Select</u> relevant background knowledge









New data



Hypotheses

Questions

New context



Hypothesise







Hypotheses

Questions

New context









New data



Hypotheses

Questions

New context



 $\label{eq:state} \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{$



Physiological Pan	ter Pruch cition of 6	ian Mell-Cere MEC in Targeted Malocule
10	-	The Bernstein III
Charges of Longood D		a Alatha at years farm, farm, farm, seas
		CALIFORNIA CALIFORNIA
And in the day agent " restored by the		
	10000	a state of the to productly be set of the way
and a second second second		
and a shaked	-	
	manufacture of	
1011 Test 7 200203	10000-0010-000	
THE REAL PROPERTY.	the subsection of	
and the local division of the local division		
	distant in the	
sen happe then particular	State and the	
the case of the second second		
and its local in summer and		
and an	and the set	Concerns married
is they down which the factor	province.	
COLUMN I		
tone Balling	-	sector and the sector with the barry of
Trans Barrier	Income of	the lot and space or to download and
The second secon	Income of	
	-	
	-	
- Euto		
e Pare		

New data



Hypotheses

Questions

New context



 $\label{eq:state} \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{$



Physiological Pan	er Pruch ction of 6	ian Mell-Corr MEC in Targeted Malocule
10	-	The Bernstein III
Charges of Longood D		a Alatha an ann a' Alatha Alatha (Maria)
		CALIFORNIA CALIFORNIA
And in the day agent " restored by the		
	10000	a state of the to productly be set of the way
and a second second second		
and a shaked	-	
	manufacture of	
1011 Test 7 200203	10000-0010-000	
THE REAL PROPERTY	the subsection of	
and the local division of the local division		
	distant in the	
sen happe then particular	State and the	
the case of the second second		
and it has a manufacture of		
and an	and the set	Concerns married
is then show which the factor.	province.	
COLUMN I		
tone Balling	-	sector and the sector with the barry of
Trans Barrier	Income of	the lot and space or to download and
The second secon	Income of	
	-	
	-	
- Euto		
e Pare		

New data





Hypotheses Questions

New context

New data





New context

Hypotheses

Questions

New data



Hypotheses

Questions

New context



New data



New data

Hypotheses

Questions

New context



New data

Common denominator

"miR-155 Activates Cytokine Gene Expression in Th17 Cells by Regulating the DNA-Binding Protein Jarid2 to Relieve Polycomb-Mediated Repression."

	Patients with SARS-Cov-2 confirmed by PCR	Patients without SARS- Cov-2 confirmed by PCR
Median age (IQR)—years	63 (53–72)	60 (49–73)
Male	787/1,309 (60.1%)	90/167 (53.9%)
Race/ethnicity—Hispanic	577/1,268 (45.5%)	62/167 (37.1%)
Race/ethnicity—African American	278/1,268 (21.9%)	46/167 (27.5%)
Race/ethnicity—White	277/1,268 (21.8%)	43/167 (25.7%)
Race/ethnicity—Asian	73/1,268 (5.8%)	5/167 (3.0%)
Race/ethnicity—Other	63/1,268 (5.0%)	11/167 (6.6%)
Obesity (BMI ≥30)	465/1,176 (39.5%)	34/149 (22.8%)ª
Comorbidities—hypertension	420/1,268 (33.1%)	67/167 (40.1%)
Comorbidities—diabetes	293/1,268 (23.1%)	34/167 (20.4%)
Comorbidities—CKD	167/1,268 (13.2%)	27/167 (16.2%)

Del Valle et al. , *Nature Medicine* (2020)

$$\frac{dx_1(t)}{dt} = x_2(t)$$

$$\frac{dx_2(t)}{dt} = ax_1(t) - bx_2(t)$$

$$\frac{d^2x_1(t)}{dt^2} = \frac{dx_2(t)}{dt}$$

where $x_1(t)$ is the serum concentration of cytokine and its rate of change by $x_2(t)$

Common denominator: Language & Abstraction!

Evidence Selection & Automating Meta-analysis

Extracting evidence from the literature at scale

Predicting toxicity: Cytokine Release Syndrome (CRS) events for CAR-T cell therapies



19hs	38hs 7 r	mins		Study	IL2	IL4	IL6	IL8	IL10	IL15	IL2R α	TNF $-\alpha$	IFN $-\gamma$	GM-CSF
			1	Jacobson et al. [37]	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
Meta-review			2	Hong et al. [38]	R	MV	R	MV	R	MV	MV	R	R	MV
			3	Yan et al. [39]	MV	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV
	_		4	Topp et al. [40]	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
~ 460 papers 17 highly	Paran	meter	5	Shah et al. [41]	MV	MV	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
aligned papers	ovtra	oction	6	Liu et al. [29]	R	R	R	MV	R	MV	MV	R	R	MV
alighted papers	CALLA		7	Sang et al. [13]	MV	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	R	MV
			8	Yan et al. [42]	MV	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV
			9	Zhao et al. [43]	MV	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV	MV
			10	Neelapu et al. [44]	R	MV	R	R	R	R	R	MV	R	R
			11	Hay et al. [24]	MV	MV	R	R	R	R	MV	MV	R	MV
			12	Turtle et al. [45]	MV	MV	R	MV	R	MV	MV	R	R	MV
			13	Hu et al. [15]	MV	MV	R	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	R	MV
			14	Teachey et al. [18]	R	R	R	R	R	MV	MV	R	R	R
			15	Porter et al. [16]	R	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	R	MV	R	MV
			16	Davila et al. [5]	MV	MV	R	MV	R	MV	MV	MV	R	R
Bogatu et al. (JBI, 2023)			17	Kalos et al. [46]	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	MV



Biomark Davila e Hay et e Hong et Hu et al Jacobsc Kalos et Liu et al Neelapu Porter e Sang et Shah et Teachey Topp et Turtle et Yan et a Yan et a Zhao et

IL-2						
IL-4						
IL-6						
IL-8						
IL-10						
IL-15						
IL-2Rα						
TNF-α						
IFN-y						
GM-CS						
CRP						
ferritin						
D-dime						
VWF						
Ang-2						
MCP-1						
granzyn						
TNFRp						
MIP1β						
MIP1a						
IL-17						
sIL6R						



Demo Wysocki, Wysocka, Carvalho, Bogatu, Miranda

Lunar

Al coordination infrastructure



Q Search components											Run	Save	📽 Share
🖄 Prompt Query	~		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						· · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · ·	
립 Output	~	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			· · · · · · · · · · · ·								· · · · · · · · · · ·
💬 Nlp	~							· · · · · · · · · ·					
Q Search Engines	~					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · ·	· · · · · · · ·	
囲 Vectorizers	~		n (n. 1917), at al al altration (n. 1917) 1 (n. 1917), at al altration (n. 1917) 1 (n. 1917), at al altration (n. 1917) 1 (n. 1917), at altration (n. 1917)	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · ·	· · · · · · ·	
Retrievers	~		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				· · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
E Vector Stores	~					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · ·	· · · · · · · ·	
Knowledge Bases	~		 a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · ·	
Extractors	~										· · · · · ·	· · · · · · · ·	
器 Structured Query	~												
➢ Coders	~					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · ·	· · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · ·
∋ Input	~										· · · · · ·		
			 (a) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b) (b	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · ·	
								· · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · ·	
		+					<i>b</i>						
			· · · · · · · · · · · · ·				· · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · ·	· · · · · · ·		· · · · · ·	

Evidence-based Scientific Reasoning

Biomarker discovery & LLMs



ESR1 TP53 NF1 AKT1 KMT2C



ESR1 TP53 NF1 AKT1 KMT2C PTEN





→ ...



Drug Discovery

Organisms produce compounds which can deliver therapeutic properties.

(Fungi, plants, extremophiles)

(antibiotic properties)



Testing each **compound** is a **long and expensive process** (~1M CHF / per **compound**).

Assessing what is already known is essential to prioritise, avoid rediscoveries and dead-ends.

Drug Discovery

For a target list of 64 organisms



Testing each **compound** is a **long and expensive process** (~1M CHF / per **compound**).

Assessing what is already known is essential to prioritise, avoid rediscoveries and dead-ends.



28.301 passages

49.671 abstracts

Thermomyces lanuginosus

	Cytochrome C	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/4342602
/	Lipozyme TL IM	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/15048592, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/29459507, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/34269888, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/36985609
	Phenylacetaldehyde	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/36212286
	2-Phenylethanol	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/36212286
	Glucosides	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/10467123
	Arbutin	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/24278310, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/34705451
	Stearic Acid	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/36766114
	Polydatin	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/34869302
	Eugenyl acetate	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/25875787
	2-Deoxy-D-glucose	https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/16110918

2-Deoxy-D-glucose

Thermomyces lanuginosus

Cytochrome C Lipozyme TL IM

Phenylacetaldehyde

2-Phenylethanol

Glucosides



1. "Crude essential oils of C. longa and S. aromaticum exhibited antimicrobial activity against all selected isolates but S. aromaticum activity was better than the C. longa with a maximum 19.3 ± 1.50 mm zone of inhibition against A. baumannii at 1.04μ L/mL MIC." This suggests that both Curcuma longa and Syzygium aromaticum have antibacterial properties, with Syzygium aromaticum being more potent against Acinetobacter baumannii, as indicated by the larger zone of inhibition and lower MIC value. 2. "GC/MS analysis revealed the abundance of components including eugenol, eugenyl acetate, b- caryophyllene, and a- Humulene in both crude oil and fractions of S. aromaticum." This indicates that eugenyl acetate is one of the main components present in Syzygium aromaticum, suggesting its potential role in the observed antibacterial activity.

Controlling Language Models & Formal Inference



Scientific Reasoning

- Step-wise explicit (verbalised) inference.
- Formal, verifiable argument & explanation.
- Preserving the positive aspects of LLMs.
- Improving control.



Scientific Reasoning

- Step-wise explicit (verbalised) inference.
- Formal, verifiable argument & explanation.
- Preserving the positive aspects of LLMs.
- Improving control.

 $\Gamma \vDash \Phi$

 Γ semantically entails Φ

 $\Gamma \vdash \Phi$

 Γ proves Φ

In our context (some notational abuse):

- explanations | arguments
- proofs | derivations



- verifiability
- control (inference guarantees)

Conclusion

TF? Patients with loss of PALB2 may benefit from PARP1 inhibition due to synthetic lethality, causing cells to rely on a singular mechanism to repair cumulative damage to DNA.

Intermediate Steps

24. Loss of PALB2 leads to a deficiency in HRR, causing the cells to rely on other DNA repair mechanisms.

(Combination of premises 8, 15, 16, 21, 22)

25. Inhibiting PARP in cells lacking PALB2 results in the accumulation of DNA damage due to the reliance on a singular repair mechanism, leading to synthetic lethality. (Combination of premises 5, 9, 10, 24)

Premises

- •••
- 5- Inhibiting PARP results in accumulation of SS breaks.
- 6- NHEJ does not use a template to repair DSB and can cause increased genomic instability.
- 7- PARP1 synthesis PAR which recruits repair proteins to sites of DNA damage
- 8- In the absence of functional HRR genes, DNA repair defaults to NHEJ.
- 9- PARP1 synthesises PAR.
- 10- PAR recruits repair proteins to damaged DNA site.

RAG



- 15- PALB2 is required for the localization of BRCA2 to sites of DNA damage
- 16- PALB2...encodes a major BRCA2 binding partner that controls its intranuclear localization and stability.
- 17- RAD51 is a eukaryotic gene that encodes the RAD51 homolog gene.
- 18- BRCA2 promotes the assembly of RAD51 homolog 1 onto SS DNA in HRR.
- 19- BRCA2 is a human gene that encodes the BRCA2 protein.
- 20- BRCA2 protein is a tumour suppressor involved in HRR.
- 21- HRR is the primary process for repairing DNA double strand breaks.
- 22- HRR repairs damage to DNA using information copied from a homologous undamaged molecule.
- 23- Undamaged homologous molecules are provided by sister chromatids or paternal/maternal copies of chromosomes.

Ethical Reasoning



Quan, Valentino, Freitas, EACL (2024)

Step (a)

Generated Explanation



Ethical Reasoning

Model	Iterations	Easy	Hard	AVG
Zero-Shot	0	40.1	55.0	47.5
Chain-Of-Thought	0	54.5	54.1	54.3
Logic-Explainer	0	52.8	58.3	55.6
	1	54.4	59.1	56.8
	2	57.5	59.1	58.3
	3	57.6	58.6	58.1
Human		85.1	83.4	84.22

Model Valid 1 Invalid \downarrow Valid and non-Redundant \uparrow Valid but Redundant \downarrow Chain-of-Thought 22.9 77.1 34.2 65.8 Logic-Explainer+0 iter. 40.4 59.6 13.4 86.6 Explanation Logic-Explainer+1 iter. 53.6 46.4 75.3 24.7Quality Logic-Explainer+2 iter. 62.0 41.6 86.4 13.6 Logic-Explainer+3 iter. 65.1 95.4 4.60 34.9

External symbolic solvers elicit valid and complete reasoning.

Logic-Explainer improve LLMs on identifying underlying moral violations.

Incomplete explanations impact LLMs' performance.

Predictive Task

Neo-Davidsonian semantics enhances logical consistency in complex sentence representation.

Causal Reasoning



Dalal, Valentino, Freitas, Buitelaar, arXiv, 2402.10767 (2024)

Mathematical Reasoning



Incompleteness

1 premise $S(Z, o) = \int \frac{Z}{o} dZ$ ['differentiate', 1, Z] $\left[\frac{\partial}{\partial Z}S(Z, o)\right] = \frac{\partial}{\partial Z}\int \frac{Z}{o} dZ$

$\begin{bmatrix} 3 \\ ['minus', 1], Derivative(S(Z, o), Z) \end{bmatrix}$ $S(Z, o) - \frac{\partial}{\partial Z}S(Z, o) = -\frac{\partial}{\partial Z}S(Z, o) + \int \frac{Z}{o} dZ$ $\begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ ['substitute_LHS_for_RHS', 3], 2 \end{bmatrix}$ $S(Z, o) - \frac{\partial}{\partial Z} \int \frac{Z}{o} dZ = -\frac{\partial}{\partial Z} \int \frac{Z}{o} dZ + \int \frac{Z}{o} dZ$

Symbolic/algebraic inference

Synthetic-stepwise, Maths (algebraic/calculus), OOD Meadows, Valentino, Teney, Freitas, arXiv:2305.12563 (2023) Meadows, Valentino, Freitas, arXiv:2307.09998 (2023) Meadows, James, Freitas (2024)

Controlling Language Spaces

Contemporary linguistic objects live on high-dimensional embedding spaces. implies a geometry

> Properties of these spaces are poorly characterised and controlled. entanglement, non-separation

Implications in terms of inference safety, out-of-distributional generalisation, ...

Q: Can we develop embedding models with better control properties? better geometrical-semantic alignment

> Fundamental for rigorous scientific reasoning Explanations | Definitions

Language Variational Autoencoders (VAEs)

Style-transfer Attribute Space



interpolation localisation: *predicate-require*

source: humans require freshwater for survival

Optimus:

- 1. humans require water and food through fossil fuels
- 2. humans require water for survival
- 3. humans produce small amounts of consumer food
- 4. human has a positive impact on a plant's survival
- 5. humans convert food into animal prey
- 6. humans make food for themselves by eating
- 7. animals require food for survival
- 8. animals require nutrients from the air
- 9. humans eat plants for food
- 10. animals require food for survival

Cluster-supervised INN:

- 1. humans require water for survival
- 2. nonhumans require water for survival
- 3. animals require water and food
- 4. animals require water to survive
- 5. animals require water to live
- 6. animals require food for survival
- 7. animals require food for survival
- 8. animals require food for survival
- 9. animals require food for survival
- 10. animals require food to survive

target: animals require food to survive



Evaluation Metrics	avg IS↑	max IS↑	min IS↑
DAE (Vincent et al., 2008)	0.144	0.330	0.055
AAE (Makhzani et al., 2015)	0.142	0.284	0.054
LAAE(Rubenstein et al., 2018)	0.172	0.347	0.056
DAAE (Shen et al., 2020)	0.055	0.061	0.023
β -VAE (Higgins et al., 2016)	0.198	0.379	0.041
AdaVAE (Tu et al., 2022)	0.085	0.105	0.050
Della (Hu et al., 2022)	0.253	0.416	0.155
Optimus (Li et al., 2020b)	0.220	0.525	0.130
AutoEncoder (Bert-GPT2)	0.259	0.585	0.165
INN (U) (our)	0.251	0.540	0.159
INN (C) (our)	0.282	<u>0.607</u>	0.206

Zhang, Carvalho, Valentino, Pratt-Hartmann, Freitas, EACL Findings (2024) Zhang, Carvalho, Pratt-Hartmann, Freitas, arXiv:2305.01713 (2023) Carvalho, Zhang, Freitas, EACL Findings (2022)

Reasoning over definitions



Multi-relational Hyperbolic Embeddings





(a) Geodesics of the Poincaré disk

(b) Embedding of a tree in \mathcal{B}^2

(c) Growth of Poincaré distance

Multi-relational Hyperbolic Embeddings



Valentino, Carvalho, Freitas, EACL (2024)

Multi-relational Hyperbolic Embeddings

Model	Dim	FT	PT	SV-d	MEN-d	SV-t	MEN-t	SL999	SCWS	353	RG
Glove	300	yes	no	12.0	54.8	7.8	57.0	19.8	46.8	44.4	57.5
Word2Vec	300	yes	no	35.2	62.3	36.4	59.9	34.5	54.5	61.9	65.7
AE	300	yes	no	34.9	42.7	32.5	42.2	35.6	50.2	41.4	64.8
CPAE	300	yes	no	42.8	48.5	34.8	49.2	39.5	54.3	48.7	67.1
CPAE-P	300	yes	yes	44.1	65.1	42.3	63.8	45.8	60.4	61.3	72.0
bert-base	768	no	yes	13.5	27.8	13.3	30.6	15.1	37.8	20.0	68.1
bert-large	1024	no	yes	16.1	23.4	14.4	26.8	13.4	35.7	19.8	60.7
defsent-bert	768	yes	yes	40.0	60.2	40.0	60.0	42.0	56.8	46.6	82.4
defsent-roberta	768	yes	yes	43.0	55.0	44.0	52.6	47.7	54.3	44.9	80.6
distilroberta-v1	768	no	yes	35.8	61.2	36.7	62.2	43.4	57.1	52.0	77.4
mpnet-base-v2	768	no	yes	45.9	64.9	42.5	67.5	49.5	58.6	56.5	81.3
sentence-t5-large	768	no	yes	49.4	63.1	50.2	66.3	57.3	56.1	51.8	85.3
Multi-Relational											
Euclidean	40	yes	no	39.1	62.9	35.7	65.4	36.3	58.2	52.1	80.9
Euclidean	80	yes	no	44.1	65.6	39.5	66.2	41.2	58.4	55.8	78.0
Euclidean	200	yes	no	47.3	67.0	41.0	67.6	43.4	60.6	55.4	78.1
Euclidean	300	yes	no	47.9	68.3	43.1	69.1	44.7	61.0	54.4	79.0
Hyperbolic	40	yes	no	36.7	66.2	34.3	66.4	31.8	57.7	49.9	75.5
Hyperbolic	80	yes	no	42.7	68.2	40.7	68.6	38.3	60.5	57.3	81.0
Hyperbolic	200	yes	no	48.8	71.9	44.7	73.2	40.7	62.5	62.5	81.6
Hyperbolic	300	yes	no	<u>50.6</u>	72.6	45.4	74.2	42.3	<u>63.0</u>	63.3	80.5

Valentino, Carvalho, Freitas, EACL (2024)

Take-away

Emerging foundations for scaling-up scientific inference

Universal framework for *integrating and reasoning over heterogeneous evidence*

Large Language Models Are a game-changing foundation.

Transformers are an efficient substrate for modelling language. Alone they are not fit for purpose for full scientific reasoning.

Controlling reasoning

Decomposition: Scientific reasoning requires coordination infrastructures. **Formal augmentation:** Close integration LLMs with symbolic solvers. **Geometrical-semantic alignment:** Language VAEs. Thank you for your attention!

Generously supported by:





Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council





contact: andre.freitas@manchester.ac.uk

ai-reasoning.net